



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

THEOBALD'S *DOUBLE FALSEHOOD*?

The article of Gamaliel Bradford, Jr., in *MLN* for February 1910, on the "History of Cardenio by Mr. Fletcher and Shakespeare," prompts me to publish the following material, gathered some time ago, in the hope that it may serve to clear up at least a part of the mystery connected with the authorship of the play *Double Falsehood* or *the Distrest Lovers*. This play, first acted¹ on December 13, 1727, was first "printed² by John Watts, at the Printing-Office in Wild-Court near Lincoln's-Inn-Fields," London, 1728. From the *same* press, "printed for John Watts," etc., was issued in the following year, 1729, a work entitled: "*A Select Collection of Novels and Histories*, in six volumes; written by the most celebrated Authors in several Languages. Many of which never appear'd in English before. All *New* translated from the Originals, by several eminent Hands. Second edition," etc. The editor was Samuel Croxall (the dedication is signed S. C.), who tells us in a preface that the favorable reception given to the first edition of this work (1720-22) has encouraged the publisher to reprint it with additions and improvements. One of the additional pieces is entitled: *The Adventures on the Black Mountains*, Vol. I, pp. 313-44, and the publisher adds, "This is the Novel, from which the Plan of a Posthumous Play, written originally by Shakespear, called *Double Falsehood*, was taken." The preface, however, while it praises Cervantes as a writer of novels, says nothing about his being the original author of this particular tale, although Theobald, in his preface to the play *Double Falsehood*, had stated that the plot was taken from *Don Quixote*. Was the assertion of Croxall intended to support Theobald's claim that Shakespeare was the author of the play? It seems so at first sight; yet his connection with the publication of the play, if there was any, will

¹ *Notes and Queries*, 7th Series, I, p. 160; Lounsbury, *The Text of Shakespeare*, New York, 1906, p. 146.

² "*Double Falsehood* or *The Distrest Lovers*, etc., written originally by W. Shakespeare, and now revised and adapted to the Stage by Mr. Theobald, the Author of Shakespeare Restor'd. London, Printed by J. Watts, at the Printing-Office in Wild-Court near Lincoln's-Inn-Fields. MDCCXXVIII." Professor Lounsbury says, p. 299, that the play had been published late in December, 1727.

probably never be known. But if *Double Falsehood* and *The Adventures on the Black Mountains*, issued from the same press, are related, our first task is to state what may be known of the novel.

As far as I have been able to discover, the edition of 1729 is the first of that novel in the peculiar form of *The Adventures*, etc. It is, of course, possible, that an earlier print was recorded in some misleading manner in the Stationers' Registers; or there may be a copy concealed in the British Museum library, but I have not found any trace of it. We can therefore assume, until an earlier edition is discovered, that Croxall printed the story from a version "new translated," which meant, to judge from other novels in his collection as well as from this one, that *The Adventures* had been merely rearranged and rejuvenated to suit his purpose. For, far from being "new translated," the novel is taken from Shelton's translation of *Don Quixote*, but revamped and adapted to the language and taste of the whole collection. It becomes necessary to inquire at this point, first, whether this rearrangement was made specifically for Croxall, or whether he merely reprinted an old copy or edition; second, is it possible to say definitely that the play was taken from *The Adventures*, as printed by Croxall, and not from the romance of Cardenio and Luscinda as it is told in Shelton's *Don Quixote*, beginning with the third book, chap. xi, and continuing with interruptions through the fourth book, chap. ix.¹ The results of this inquiry will be based entirely on an examination of Shelton's *Don Quixote*, Croxall's *The Adventures*, etc., and *Double Falsehood*.

In Shelton's translation, which agrees with the Spanish original, the course of the story is frequently interrupted by the characters of *Don Quixote*, namely Don Quixote himself, Sancho Panza, the curate, the barber, and others. But Croxall's novel, in gathering all these parts together, changes the order of events as found in Shelton, shortens the whole to about two-thirds of its original length by giving a résumé of rambling portions, and, naturally, turns every first person into the third. Croxall's version may be said to relate the events in a more natural sequence, avoiding the repetition of details;

¹ All my references will be to *The History of the Valorous and Witty Knight Errant Don Quixote of the Mancha*, by Miguel de Cervantes, translated by Thomas Shelton, 3 vols., Macmillan & Co., 1900, as this edition is more accessible; but I have given the spelling of the edition of 1612 in the excerpts.

in Shelton, the interruptions necessitated a going back to pick up the thread of the story, which, if followed through *Don Quixote* according to the order of events in *The Adventures*, would take us through the various chapters in about the following order: book third, chap. x, book fourth, chap. i, book third, chaps. x, xiii, ix, xiii, book fourth, chaps. i, ix, book third, chap. xiii, book fourth, chaps. i, ix. A few additional transfers may be found in ideas, descriptions, and the like, of little importance.

For lack of space, the following examples will have to suffice to prove how *The Adventures on the Black Mountains* were "new translated" out of Shelton. First I shall give some examples to show how Shelton was plundered with but very few changes, which could have been made only with the object of rejuvenating his Elizabethan style; they will help, moreover, in determining whether the rearrangement was specifically made for Croxall, or not.

SHELTON'S TRANSLATION

1. "I rendred him thanks . . . and therefore departed presently to acquaint him (my father) with my desires: who, at the time which I entered into a Chamber wherein he was, stood with a Letter open in his hand; and espying me, e're I could breake my mind vnto him, gaue it me, saying, 'By that Letter, *Cardenio*, you may gather the desire that Duke *Ricardo* beares, to doe you any pleasure or fauour.'

"This Duke *Ricardo*, as I thinke you know, *Sirs*, already, is a *Grande* of *Spayne*, whose Dukedome is seated in the best part of all *Andaluzia*. I tooke the Letter and read it; which appeared so vrgent, as I myselfe accounted it would be ill done, if my father did not accomplish the contents thereof, which were indeed, that he should presently addresse me to his Court, to the end I might be companion (and not seruant) to his eldest sonne; and that he would incharge himselfe with the aduancing of me to such preferments as might be answerable vnto the value and estima-

CROXALL'S NOVEL

1. "As Cardenio entered his Father's Chamber, he found him with a Letter open in his Hand; who espying his Son, ere he could break his Mind to him, gave it him with these Words, *By that Letter*, Cardenio, you may gather the Desire that Duke Ricardo bears to do you Favour. This Duke was a *Grandee* of the first Rank in Spain, and whose Dukedom was seated in the best part of all *Andaluzia*. Cardenio read the Letter, which was a pressing Mandate for his instantly addressing himself to Court, in Order to become the Companion of the Duke's eldest Son; and the Duke, on his Part, charg'd himself with advancing Cardenio to Preferments, answerable to the Value and Esteem he had for his Person. The enamour'd Cardenio embarrass'd with such a Summons, was struck dumb at the Contents of the Letter; but was still more confounded what to do, upon his Father's acquainting him, that he must depart within two Days to attend the Duke's Com-

[SHELTON]

tion he made of my person. I past over the whole Letter, and was stricken dumbe at the reading thereof, but chiefly hearing my father to say, '*Cardenio*, thou must depart within two dayes, to accomplish the Dukees desire; and omit not to render Almighty God thanks, which doth thus open the way by which thou mayest attaine in fine to that which I know thou dost merite.' And to these words added certaine others of fatherly counsell and direction. The terme of my departure arriued, and I spoke to my *Luscinda* on a certaine night, and recounted vnto her all that passed, and likewise to her father, entreating him to ouerslip a few dayes, and deferre the bestowing of his daughter else-where, vntill I went to understand Duke *Ricardo* his will; which he promised me, and she confirmed it with a thousand othes and promises." (Book 3, chap. x.)

2. "It therefore befell that, as there is no secrecie amongst friends so great but they will communicate it the one to the other, and the familiaritie which I had with *Don Ferdinando* was now past the limits of fauour, and turned into dearest amitie, he reuealed vnto me all his thoughts, but chiefly one of of his loue, which did not a little molest him; for he was enamoured on a Farmers daughter, that was his Fathers vassall" (Book 3, chap. x; jumps to Book 4, chap. i). Dorothea speaks: "My parents . . . are but Farmours and plaine people, but without any touch or spot of bad blood, and as we vsually say, Old, rustie Christians, yet so rusty and ancient as yet their riches and magnificent port gaine them, by little and little, the title of Gentilitie, yea, and of worship also; although the treasure and Nobility, whereof they made most price

[CROXALL]

mands. This unforeseen Incident made *Cardenio* think it an improper Opportunity to break the Secret of his Passion to his Father. The Term of his Departure came faster than he could have wish'd: and all that he could do under the present Circumstance, was to recount the Truth of Affairs to *Luscinda's* Father, entreat him to ouerslip a few Days, and to defer the bestowing of his Daughter elsewhere, till *Cardenio* understood Duke *Ricardo's* Pleasure. Her Father readily comply'd, and pass'd his Promise to performance of the Terms: and *Luscinda* confirm'd her Fidelity to *Cardenio* with a thousand endearing Protestations." (P. 315.)

2. "As Intimacy gradually contracts Trust and Confidence, there is no Secresie amongst Friends so great, but They will communicate it the One to the Other. The Familiarity, which *Cardenio* had with *Don Ferdinand*, was now past the Limits of Favour, and turned into dearest Amity. The young Lord reveal'd to him all his Thoughts, but chiefly one of his Love which did not a little molest him. *Don Ferdinand*, it happen'd, was become enamour'd of a Farmer's Daughter, that was his Father's Vassal. Her Parents were plain People by their Profession, but without any Touch or Stain of bad Blood: so their Riches and Port gain'd them, by little and little, the Title of Gentility, and the Dues of Worship. Their greatest Treasure, and their best Nobility, in their own Opinion, was their having such a Daughter as *Dorothea*," etc. (P. 316.)

[SHELTON]

[CROXALL]

and account, was to have had mee for their daughter," etc.

3. "But on the fourth day after I had arriued, there came a man in my search with a Letter, which he deliuered vnto me, and by the indorsement I knew it to be *Luscinda's*; for the hand was like hers. I opened it (not without feare and assaylement of my senses), knowing that it must haue beene some serious occasion which could moue her to write vnto me, being absent, seeing shee did it so rarely, euen when I was present. I demaunded of the Bearer, before I read, who had deliuered it to him, and what time he had spent in the way. He answered me, 'that passing by chance at mid-day thorow a Streete of the Citie, a very beautifull Ladie did call him from a certain Window. Her eyes were all be-blubbered with teares, and said vnto him very hastily, "Brother, if thou beest a Christian, as thou appearest to be one, I pray thee for Gods sake, that thou doe forthwith addresse this Letter to the place and person that the superscription assigneth (for they be well knowne), and therein thou shalt doe our Lord great seruice; and because thou maist not want meanes to doe it, take what thou shalt find wrapped in that Hand-kerchiefe." And, saying so, she threw out of the Window a Hand-kerchiefe, wherein were lapped vp a hundred Rials, this Ring of Gold which I carrie here, and that Letter which I deliuered vnto you; and presently, without expecting mine answer, shee departed, but first saw me take vp the Hand-kerchiefe and Letter, and then I made her signes that I would accomplish herein her command. And after, perceyuing the paines I might take in bringing you it, so wel considered, and seeing by the

3. "The fourth Day of his Court-Attendance was now running its Course, when a Messenger arrives Post in Search of him with a Letter, the Superscription of which he knew to be the Hand-writing of *Luscinda*. He took it from the Bearer with a Fear, that almost overpower'd his Senses: He knew it must be some serious and uncommon Occasion, that could excite her to write to him at that Juncture, and address her Letter by that extraordinary Conveyance. Before *Cardenio* would venture to peruse the *Billet*, he demanded of the Bearer, Who had deliver'd it to him? He replied, that passing by Chance at Mid-day through a Street of their Village, a beautiful young Lady had call'd to him from a Window, that her Eyes were gushing with Tears, and that she had conjur'd him, as he appear'd to be a Christian, and as her Request was in the Cause of Goodness and Religion, that he would with the utmost Speed convey that Paper for her to the Place and Person, to which the Superscription assigned; and that with it she had thrown him down a Ring of Gold, and *Purse of Rials*, to purchase his Diligence in the Business. *Cardenio*, pale and trembling at this Information, thank'd the Messenger, and beg'd he would reconvey an Answer from him; after which *Cardenio* withdrew, that his Emotions might not be observable, and read the following afflicting Letter.

[SHELTON]

indorsement, that you were the man to whom it was address—for, sir, I know you very wel,—and also obliged to doe it by the teares of that beautifull Ladie, I determined not to trust any other with it, but to come and bring it you my selfe in person; and in sixteene houres since it was giuen vnto me, I haue trauelled the iourney you know, which is at least eighteene leagues long.’ Whilst the thankfull new messenger spake thus vnto me, I remayned in a manner hanging on his words, and my thighs did tremble in such manner, as I could very hardly sustayne my selfe on foot; yet taking courage, at last I opened the Letter, whereof these were the Contents:

“‘The word that Don Ferdinando hath past vnto you to speake to your father, that he might speake to mine, he hath accomplished more to his owne pleasure then to your profit. For, sir, you shall vnderstand that he hath demanded me for his wife; and my father (borne away by the aduantage of worths which he supposes to bee in Don Ferdinando more than in you) hath agreed to his demaund in so good earnest, as the espousals shall be celebrated within these two daies, and that so secretly and alone, as only the heauens and some folke of the house shall be witnesses. How I remaine, imagine, and whether it be conuenient you should returne, you may consider; and the successe of this affaire shall let you to perceiue whether I loue you well or no. I beseech Almighty God that this may arriue vnto your hands before mine shall see itselfe in danger to ioyne itselfe with his, which keepeth his promised faith so ill,’” etc. (Book 3, chap. xiii.)

[CROXALL]

“‘The promise that false *Ferdinand* has pass’d to you to speak to your Father, that he might speak to mine, he has accomplish’d more to his own Pleasure, than your Satisfaction; for you shall understand, dearest *Cardenio*, that he has demanded me for his Wife. My Father, borne away by certain Differences of Fortune, which he thinks the weightier in *Don Ferdinand’s* Scale, has agreed to his Demand. The Nuptials are to be celebrated within these two Days; and that so secretly, as only the Heavens, and some Particulars of our House, are to be the Witnesses. How I remain, imagine, by what you yourself feel; and whether it be convenient you should return, you only can determine. The Success of this Affair, in all Events, shall let you perceive, whether I love you. May this reach your Hand, before mine shall be in Danger to be given away to the most perfidious of Men! As yet, I am your most disconsolate,

LUSCINDA.”
(Pp. 326–27.)

Episodes which are interrupted in the original English version are joined in a way that may be illustrated by the following: Dorothea has completed her story and we go back to find out what became of Luscinda:

4. To such Afflictions of Heart, from a State of Ease and Tranquility, and to such personal Dangers and Exigencies, from being the Care and Darling of her indulgent Parents, did the wanton Passion of *Don Ferdinand* reduce the credulous, deceived *Dorothea*. Nor did the like Intemperance of his Love cost the charming *Luscinda* much less Anxiety. He would, indeed, have married her, etc. (P. 336.)

If space permitted, a complete list of the changes of style made in Shelton for the edition of Croxall might be given at this point to help in approximately establishing the age of *The Adventures*. As it is, the examples given above may serve to indicate the manner in which the "translator" seems to have tried to bring the Elizabethan English of Shelton somewhat up to date by changing the forms which at the time of the "translation" were most apparently obsolete. It was but natural that in the cheap process to which the language of Shelton was subjected, much of its old character should have remained.

However, where the "translator" displays his talent independently, much sentimental rubbish may generally be found, and the changes made in Shelton are certainly not improvements in style. But in spite of all these defects, the novel is singularly in keeping with the taste of the age, if we are to judge by "the favorable reception" given to Croxall's collection of novels. We are, therefore, forced to conclude that *The Adventures on the Black Mountains* was especially arranged for Croxall by some unknown "eminent hand," and that it is not likely, both from the fact that this is the first known edition of this particular tale, as well as from its revamped character, that he was merely reprinting an old manuscript. If the latter were the case, we should have the extraordinary coincidence of a play and the tale upon which it is founded surviving in manuscript, only to be printed independently, within a year of each other, by the same printer!

A few of the arbitrary changes made in the plot or situations must be mentioned, because some of them have a direct bearing upon the play which is to be considered presently.

SHELTON

1. *Dorothea*: "For, one night as I sate in my chamber, only attended by a yong Mayden that serued me, I hauing shut the doores very safe," etc. (Vol. I, p. 260.)

2. Shelton tells the story of Don Ferdinando's and Luscinda's interrupted marriage ceremony very simply, and gives nothing but *Don Quixote*. Croxall makes a more melodramatic scene out of it, by adding a description not a word of which is in Shelton. (Vol. I, pp. 245 ff.)

3. *Dorothea* has stolen away from home: "And whilst I staide thus in the Citie, ignorant of what I might doe, . . . I heard a cryer goe about publikely, promising great rewards to any one that could finde me out, giuing signes of the very age and apparell I wore," etc. (Vol. I, p. 268.)

4. In Shelton, the curate and the barber are waiting for Sancho Panza: "Both, therefore, arresting there quietly vnder the shadow, there arriued to their hearing the sound of a voyce which, *without being accompanied by any instrument*, did resound so sweet and melodiously as they remained greatly admired, because they esteemed not that to be a place wherein any so good a Musician might make his abode," etc. The person discovered is Cardenio, who, it says, "at this season was in his right sense," etc. (Vol. I, p. 236.)

CROXALL

1. "One Night, when this innocent young Beauty was retir'd to her Chamber, and had dismiss'd her Attendant to taste the Pleasures of Solitude," etc. (P. 318.)

2. Now blazed the Hall with Lights, a little Altar with Tapers was brought forth, close to which follow'd a reverend Priest. Mean-while *Cardenio* stood sweating with Agony; *Luscinda* wrung her Hands, and with streaming Eyes, and distracted Motions, shew'd her Aversion to the Marriage. *Don Ferdinand* was now soothing her with Courtly Gestures; and her Father urging her with Menaces to yield Obedience to his Will." (P. 329.)

3. "All the Night, she and her Attendant Swain travell'd on by the obscure Light of a clouded Moon. Early the next Morning, as she was afterwards acquainted, a Cryer went about publicly, by her Father's Order, describing her Age, Form, and Apparel, and offering great Rewards to any One that should bring her Home," etc. (P. 334.)

4. Croxall has:

"At a Season when *Cardenio* was in his right Sense, and surrounded by these willing Comforters, they heard from the inner Parts of the Rocks, the Sound of a sweet Voice, *accompanied with the Melody of a Lute*. This might well prove the Subject of Attention and Wonder, as they esteem'd not that to be a Place, wherein 'twas probable so good a Musician should make his Abode." But here it is *Dorothea* who is discovered singing and playing upon a lute. They find "the Contents of the Air to be a Virgin's Complaint for Love betray'd, and broken Friendship." (P. 338.)

Other examples could be added, notably from such passages as were penned by the hack "translator" when he was retelling or condensing parts of the original.

Let us now try to determine, if possible, why the play *Double Falsehood* was taken from *The Adventures*, etc., as printed by Croxall, and not from the romance of Cardenio and Luscinda, as it is told in Shelton's *Don Quixote*. I may add here, that the Spanish original does not enter into the question, because I have found no evidence whatsoever which would connect either *The Adventures* or *Double Falsehood* with the work of Cervantes. Moreover, Theobald, in giving the source of the play, seems to refer to Shelton's *Don Quixote*; for he asserts that *Don Quixote* "was published in the year 1611," a date much closer to the appearance of Shelton's first part, 1612, than that of the Spanish original, which was printed in 1605.

Let us begin with the *dramatis personae*, as they are printed at the head of the play, placing at their side the corresponding characters of *The Adventures*.

DOUBLE FALSEHOOD	THE ADVENTURES, ETC.
<i>Men:</i>	<i>Men:</i>
Duke Angelo	Duke Ricardo
Roderick, his Elder Son	Eldest Son
Henriquez, his Younger Son	Ferdinand, second son
Don Bernard, Father to Leonora	Father of Luscinda
Camillo, Father to Julio	Cleonardo, Father of Cardenio
Julio, in Love with Leonora	Cardenio
Citizen	Messenger
Master of the Flocks	Master of the Flocks
First Shepherd }	Shepherds
Second Shepherd }	
<i>Women:</i>	<i>Women:</i>
Leonora	Luscinda
Violante	Dorothea
<i>Scene</i> , the Province of Andalusia in Spain.	<i>Scene</i> , the Province of Andalusia (a Province the richest in all Spain).

In giving the scene of the story at the outset, Shelton merely says, "the place of my birth is one of the best cities in Andalusia," Vol. I, p. 198. *The Adventures*, etc., begins: "To a delightful Village near Seville, in the Province of Andalusia (a Province the richest in all Spain etc. was good *Cleonardo* retired)."

As regards the number of characters who form a part of the novel, it will be seen that it corresponds absolutely with that of the play, while those personages, such as attendants, servants, and the like, too insignificant to be mentioned in the play's list of *dramatis personae*, occupy the same unimportant place in the thread of the story. It would seem, therefore, that such a close correspondence of actors would have been impossible if the play had been taken directly from Shelton's *Don Quixote*; there the course of the story is somewhat different: it is broken and the intervals are filled with a confusing array of outside characters, such as Don Quixote, Sancho, the barber, the curate, and others who furnish numerous irrelevant episodes. Yet even more noteworthy is the fact that the plot of the novel, shorn of all those extraneous and interrupting elements in *Don Quixote*, should present an excellent parallel to the play also; this cannot be a mere coincidence.

The construction of the play shows practically no originality whatsoever; the main additions made in it, namely, the breaking into the marriage ceremony by Julio, and the meeting of the fathers of the young people, were suggested by the novel itself, and made necessary by the paucity of episodes. The climax of the play, upon which Mr. Bradford bestows especial praise, is developed out of the close of the novel, in which all are reconciled at the inn where they have met. The particular introduction of the fathers at this place does not indicate remarkable constructive powers, for the novel tells us that everybody is looking for someone, Cardenio for Luscinda, Dorothea for Ferdinand, the fathers for their children; and the inn, therefore, became the most natural place where all was to be forgiven and everyone was to be happy once more.

In giving the order of scenes in the play, what follows is intended to emphasize, first, the fact of a similar sequence of events in the novel, and, second, the direct imitation by the play of features which do not exist in Shelton and which the author of *Double Falsehood* could have taken only from Croxall's version.

Act I, scene 1, Duke Angelo and his son Roderick speak of the absent Henriquez, the father telling his son to "bring Julio to Court." This very short scene is followed by one in a village at the house of Camillo, who appears with a letter ordering Julio to Court. The

latter enters, and after reading the mandate expresses in an aside his regret at leaving Leonora. He had intended to tell his father of his suit, but now defers it: "No moving of my Love-Suit to him now?" (p. 4). Of this there is nothing in Shelton, I, p. 200, but Croxall has: "This unforeseen Incident made *Cardenio* think it an improper Opportunity to break the Secret of his Passion to his Father" (p. 315). Leonora and her maid now enter; Julio bids the former farewell with the words: "Duke, I obey thy Summons" (p. 6), the latter word being used only in the novel of Croxall. This scene gives at length the "thousand endearing Protestations" of the novel (p. 316). Bernard, Leonora's father, enters, to whom Julio promises that he will speak to his father, Camillo, of his love. In the third scene Henriquez and some servants with lights are found under Violante's window. She appears and reproaches him for his unworthy suit. "Henr.: 'Why, this Dismission Does more invite my Staying'" (p. 12), which is expressed in the novel (p. 318): "All these Cautions on her Side but more inflamed the amorous Appetite on his." This act corresponds throughout with pp. 313-18 of the novel, which tells of Cardenio's love for Luscinda, the arrival of the letter ordering him to Court, his departure, his arrival at the Duke's palace, and the love of Ferdinand for Dorothea.

The latter is the subject of Act II, scene 1: a village; Henriquez comes from Violante's room, having possessed her by means of a promise of marriage. His monologue is overheard by some citizens who do not speak to him, and whose presence is gratuitous, since it leads to nothing. We learn that Henriquez has already transferred his affection to Leonora, though it is hard to see when he had time to meet her. Some time has elapsed before the next scene, in which we find Violante bewailing her fall. Henriquez sends her a letter: "Our Prudence should now teach us to forget" (p. 16). In scene 3, his courtship of Leonora is continued. Leonora's father gladly admits the suit of Henriquez and tries to force her to accept him: she must marry him in two days. Then follows a short scene between Bernard and Camillo, the fathers of Leonora and Julio; the former says his daughter is not for Julio, and they part quarreling. Leonora now appears at the window; a citizen enters to whom she throws a *purse* with money, saying: "I *conjure* you, Convey this *Paper* to

him, and believe me, you do Heav'n Service in't," etc. (p. 24). This episode imitates the novel more closely than Shelton, as can be seen from the third example (p. 5), quoted above. The act corresponds with pp. 319-27 of the novel, which proceeds with Dorothea's fall, and returning to Cardenio's love for Luscinda tells of Ferdinand's disloyalty to his friend and his sudden infatuation for Luscinda, of Cardenio's absence, Luscinda's anguish, and her message to him.

Act III, scene 1, continues the episode and presents Julio, who receives Leonora's letter. He curses the treachery of Henriquez and decides on an "exchange of Habit" (p. 26) with the citizen, so as to be able to enter her house unrecognized. Of this disguise there is nothing in Shelton, Vol. I, p. 244. But Croxall adds: "Disguising himself for Fear of *Don Ferdinand's* spies, he secretly approached the House of *Luscinda*" (p. 328). The next scene discloses Leonora at home; Julio enters, and she tells him: "what my Letter hath declared . . . is this Instant on th' effecting" (p. 28). In Croxall she begins: "the disastrous Moment is at Hand" (p. 328), of which there is nothing in Shelton. She conceals Julio behind the arras and the marriage ceremony follows. "Scene opens to a large Hall: an Altar prepared with Tapers. Enter at one Door Servants with Lights, Henriquez, Don Bernard and Churchman. At another, Attendants to Leonora" (p. 29). Leonora remonstrates with Henriquez and her father. This is mostly from Croxall, namely the altar with tapers, while the girl's remonstrance, the father's threats, and the like were suggested by the novel, as can be seen from the second example above (p. 8), of arbitrary changes made in Shelton. Then follows Julio's interruption, which is original with the play but may have been suggested by the novel: "Her Refusal had been a Cue for his rushing out to her Assistance; but now he remained confounded," etc. (p. 329). Julio is ejected and Leonora swoons. "Henr.: 'Bear her to her Chamber: Life flows in her again. Pray bear her hence: And tend her as you would the World's best Treasure. Don Bernard, this wild Tumult soon will cease, the Cause remov'd, and all return to Calmness. . . . Let the Priest wait: Come, go we in," etc. (p. 32). In Croxall we are told: "the intended Bride, languishing and half recover'd, was ordered into another Room, and the Priest directed by Ferdinand to wait, till Matters were better settled"

(p. 330); and "by reason of the Strength of her Fits [she] *was convey'd to her Chamber*" (p. 337), of which there is nothing in Shelton, Vol. I, p. 248 or p. 266. In the following scene Roderick appears, still troubled about his brother and "Julio's departure thus in Secret" (p. 32). Camillo enters and accuses him of complicity and then the same citizen who brought Leonora's letter announces Julio's flight. Bernardo comes in, and another quarrel ends with the reconciliation of the fathers. Violante now enters and learns, as in the novel, that the marriage was prevented. Her servant says: "Your Father makes mighty Offers yonder by a Cryer, to any One can bring you home again" (p. 37). How much nearer this is to Croxall than Shelton, may be seen from the third example above (p. 8) of the arbitrary changes made by the novel. Violante now decides to wear a shepherd's habit. This act corresponds with pp. 327-30 of the novel, the last short scene being taken from p. 334. The story continues with Cardenio's return to Luscinda, their meeting, the interrupted marriage ceremony, and the flight of Cardenio. The reconciliation of the fathers in the play is original, but was a necessary and rather obvious bit of padding in an otherwise extremely uneventful plot.

Act IV, scene 1, presents a wide plain with a prospect of mountains. Shepherds with the Master of the flock, and Violante in boy's clothes appear. Julio's madness is described. He enters and gives a demonstration of his state. Violante is recognized as a woman and assaulted by the Master. Roderick enters, looking for Henriquez, and the latter appears, in search of Leonora, who has fled to a convent. They go together to find her. In the next scene Julio and two gentlemen enter. One of the latter says: "He's calm again: I'll take this Interval to work upon Him. These wild and solitary Places, Sir, but feed your Pain; let better Reason guide you; And quit this forlorn State, that yields no Comfort." "(Lute sounds within.) Julio: 'Ha! hark, a Sound from Heaven! . . . I'm often visited with these sweet Airs, The Spirit of some hapless Man that dy'd, And left his Love hid in a faithless Woman, Sure haunts these Mountains.' (Violante sings)" (p. 47). The subject of her song is the "sorrow of a lost maid," and of a false swain who has betrayed her. That this is taken directly from the novel will be seen by comparing

Shelton and Croxall in the fourth example above (p. 8) of arbitrary changes made in the former. Then follows the effect of Violante's song on Julio, a sorrowful monologue by the forsaken girl, the meeting of Julio and Violante, after which he vows that he will not forsake her until her wrong has been atoned for by Henriquez. This act corresponds with the novel as follows: the first part of scene 1 is a fusion of different suggestions taken from pp. 330-36, the rest, and scene 2, being from pp. 336-41 of the novel. After the flight of Cardenio from the marriage ceremony, his life in the mountains and among the shepherds is depicted. Then Dorothea's plight is shown, her decision to leave her home to find Ferdinand, her experiences with her attendant, and with the Master of the flock when they discover that she is a woman, and her retreat to the wilds of the mountains. Then the narrative returns to Luscinda's escape to a convent and the pursuit by Ferdinand. Thereafter it continues the story of Dorothea and her meeting in the mountains with Cardenio.

Act V has two scenes, one a prospect of the mountains, the other an apartment in the Lodge. The fathers, in search of the children, here meet. All enter in succession, Roderick, Leonora and Henriquez, then Violante who accuses Henriquez, finally Julio, and a general reconciliation follows. This act is developed out of pp. 341-44 of the novel: Cardenio and Dorothea are "to suffer themselves to be conducted to an Inn." Luscinda, "snatched from the Convent," is brought there by Ferdinand, and after explanations, mutual forgiveness, and a reconciliation, all ends in a "sumptuous Entertainment."

If it has been possible to show that the novel entitled *The Adventures on the Black Mountains* is nothing more than Shelton furbished up for Croxall's collection at the beginning of the eighteenth century, and if it can be asserted that *Double Falsehood* is a slavish dramatization of the novel, it has become unnecessary to insist that there is not the remotest probability that Theobald had a lost "History of Cardenio" either by Shakespeare or Fletcher as a basis for his play *Double Falsehood*. The names of the cast must have been conceived with the original construction, for it seems incredible that Theobald should have rewritten a play in verse to the extent of putting *Julio* for *Cardenio*, and the like, in every verse in which one of the many

names occurs. And what reason could he have had for changing the names? It is impossible to discover one. He does not seem to have been acquainted with that hazy and ill-founded tradition which attributes a "History of Cardenio" to Shakespeare and Fletcher, or he would have left the names of the original story. He may have heard that there was once a play taken from this episode in *Don Quixote*, and so was impelled to try his hand at one, attributing it to the writer he knew better than did any of his contemporary critics.

The story of the origin and character of the manuscripts of *Double Falsehood* is unconvincing from beginning to end. Theobald tells us in his Preface:

It has been alleg'd as incredible, that such a Curiosity should be stifled and lost to the World for above a Century. To This my Answer is short; that tho' it never till now made its Appearance on the Stage, yet *one* of the Manuscript Copies, which I have, *is above Sixty Years' Standing* [the italics are mine] in the Handwriting of Mr. *Downes*, the famous Old Prompter; and, as I am credibly inform'd, was early in the Possession of the celebrated Mr. *Betterton*, and by Him design'd to have been usher'd into the World. What Accident prevented This Purpose of his, I do not pretend to know: Or thro' what Hands it had successively pass'd before that Period of Time. There is a Tradition (which I had from the Noble Person, who supply'd me with One of my Copies) that it was given by our Author, as a Present of Value, to a Natural Daughter of his, for whose Sake he wrote it, in the Time of his Retirement from the Stage. Two other Copies I have, etc. . . . Another Objection has been started . . . that the Tale of this Play, being built upon a Novel in *Don Quixot*, Chronology is against Us, and *Shakespeare* could not be the Author. But it happens that *Don Quixot* was publish'd in the Year 1611, and *Shakespeare* did not dye till April 1616, a sufficient Interval of Time for All that We want granted.

What a collection of old wives' tales! Three manuscript copies of an unknown play by Shakespeare: as if one were not wonderful enough, Theobald goes out and buys more copies; a tradition graciously supplied by an unmentioned "noble person" together with one copy; the play was given to a natural daughter by Shakespeare, as a present of value, the former being as improbable as the second is impossible, considering the worth of *Double Falsehood*. Downes, the prompter, d. 1710, in whose handwriting one of the copies was preserved, had been dead some seventeen years when the play appeared, and there is no evidence that the handwriting was submitted for

examination to those who doubted Theobald's word. Nor would any such examination have been conclusive, since even experts on handwritings disagree on the authenticity of a specific hand. Besides, there is a curious absence of other names connected with the story of these manuscripts; the whole legend of *Double Falsehood* has rested upon Theobald's assertion, and he mentions in connection with it only men like Downes and Betterton, long in their graves.

Now all critics of Shakespeare have always agreed that there is nothing of his in this play, and Theobald asserted (and perhaps he ought to know) that Fletcher had no hand in it. And how can we believe that three manuscript copies, based wholly or in part upon *The Adventures*, survived to be furbished up by Theobald for the stage, with all this hazy evidence about the manuscripts and the disagreement between Theobald and subsequent critics? Perhaps the conclusion of Churton Collins is the nearest to the truth after all, and the play was for the most part "from Theobald's own pen." He was certainly capable of writing a piece which is a manifest attempt to reproduce Shakespeare's language. What else are such absurd lines as: "Marry, now there is some Moral in his Madness" (p. 41), not to mention several others? If Croxall wanted to back Theobald's claim by printing the actual source of the play, in the hope that people would be led to believe that *Don Quixote* and not *The Adventures* was the real source, he made a mistake. Even the change of all of the names of the original could not always prevent people from comparing the three productions upon which this article is based.

The result of all our comparisons is, then, that *The Adventures* is directly taken from Shelton. When? Hardly immediately, else there would not have been the linguistic change; that in all probability it was done for Croxall, because the changes in incident and language are such as to make the story conform more closely to the taste of the later seventeenth or early eighteenth century. Moreover, to have been used by Fletcher, it must have been done before 1625, a thing so improbable that it may almost be called impossible. Therefore either the play is neither by Fletcher nor Shakespeare, or the play is not taken from *The Adventures on the Black Mountains*.

But it has been shown that there is a definite relation between the novel and the play, namely that the latter is based on the former, and thus belongs to the early eighteenth century. Against this there is nothing but Theobald's story, which convinces no one. And if Theobald hoodwinked the public, would he do it for the sake of someone else? That seems most unlikely. Therefore, in conclusion, if it cannot be proved that the revamped version of the romance of Cardenio entitled *The Adventures on the Black Mountains* was known at least sixty years (the age of the Downes manuscript) before the first appearance of the play, according to the evidence which remains, Theobald must have obtained a manuscript copy of the novel, possibly from the printer Watts. At all events, his name is the only one that can be definitely connected with the authorship of *Double Falsehood*.

RUDOLPH SCHEVILL

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA